

8

DENYING ENTAILMENT

Suppose that you have power to lift your foot. Suppose further that there is a 2000 pound rock on your foot and that power to lift your foot entails also, in this situation, power to lift the 2000-pound rock. It seems that to have the power to lift your foot that you also must have the power to do something you truly do not have it within your power to do, that is, power to lift the rock. It seems reasonable to conclude that you really don't have power to lift your foot in this situation because it entails also having the power to lift the rock, which you can't do.

This situation is parallel in some important respects to the situation of power to do otherwise if God has foreknowledge. Suppose that you have power to lift your foot at a time t . Suppose also that God knew in 1900 that you would not lift your foot at t . It seems that to have the power to lift your foot that you must have also the further power to change the fact that God knew that you would not move your foot. However, since you do not have power to change the past fact that God knew you would not move your foot, it follows that you do not have power to move your foot either. This situation thus seems to be like the case where you cannot move your foot unless you can also lift the 2000 pound rock. Of course, it is not in your power to move the rock even if you decided to do so, whereas if you actually decided to lift your foot in the latter situation, it seems that God would have known something different instead. The difference in these two situations has led some philosophers to suggest that the cases of the 2000-pound rock and of God's foreknowledge are differ-